

Summary of Representations

Ibrox Stadium

Objections to the order by people attending events (including residents in the area)

Economic Impact

The proposals would discourage fans from attending football matches, and the council should instead be supporting football clubs and their fans who contribute to the local economy.

The proposals would detrimentally affect Rangers Football Club, its supporters and local businesses in the area. Supporters spend money in local shops when attending matches. The restrictions are likely to reduce match attendances and therefore revenue for local businesses.

It is necessary to consider the financial and social cost of adverse economic impact and resulting unemployment.

There is support for other stadiums throughout the world by local authorities, to encourage citizens to participate in viewing sport, which benefits many cities. These proposals on the other hand hinder such participation.

There should be consistency with respect to other events, for example concerts at Glasgow Green and Bellahouston Park, where similar controls are not proposed.

Concern is expressed about lack of communication with RFC and supporters. These proposals will affect Rangers Supporters' clubs who have not been involved. There should have been consultation with stakeholders.

Disadvantaged Groups

Elderly people, women, children and people with disabilities will be discouraged from attending matches by not being able to park close to the ground, resulting in walking distances which are too great for them to manage. Some people are not fit enough to travel by train or bus.

Matches in winter could pose additional safety risks or inconvenience. Some people have physical difficulties but don't qualify for blue badge. Consideration could be given to age related permits.

Carers also have difficulties not using cars as they may need to leave quickly in case of an emergency.

The proposals would discriminate against disadvantaged groups.

Inconsiderate and unsafe parking

There is some sympathy for residents relating to increased activity and parking on-street in the area around the stadium. But there is no evidence of any major problems caused by supporters parking on residential streets, which generally causes no inconvenience to residents.

Generally, people park considerately and appropriately and it is considered that people abide by any restrictions in place, eg cones which are placed to restrict parking on emergency routes. Objectors question whether there is significant inconsiderate parking on corners or blocking driveways.

Other options may be available to ease the effect on residential areas, rather than introducing a blanket restriction on on-street parking within a 1km zone. Could even consider an on-street parking charge to reduce the demand but allow for people who really need to park near to the stadium.

Restrictions on some residential side streets may be understandable, but not a blanket coverage and not industrial areas which are generally non-operational at match times. Here parking spaces would be left vacant whilst parking moved out to other residential areas outside the zone.

There are usually still spaces available. Many streets have large dwellings with off street parking. Many roads around Ibrox are surrounded by vacant or derelict land, and converting these for car parks would help, with people willing to pay for parking.

The proposals are disproportionate given supporter parking is only a few hours for a limited number of days each year. The stadium was there before residents, so people moved into the area in knowledge of activity taking place on match days. On the other hand, people further out may not have expected such activity. The proposals would not fix any existing problem, but simply move it out to a wider area.

Concerns from local residents represent a very small percentage of the local populations. The majority of local residents have no complaints.

Where illegal parking occurs, there are already measures in place to address this which could be enhanced by additional yellow line parking restrictions in areas where parking would be unsafe. Enforcement of the parking restrictions in place should then be undertaken. There are regularly parking wardens on patrol at the moment.

Parking and Public Transport Provision - General

The order is being introduced without all the factors and potential consequences being considered. There should be more survey information (eg capacity and use of long-term car parks and parking around the stadium on match days, and information from public transport providers (particularly SPT). The order should at least be delayed until suitable alternative public transport is in place

There is some support among objectors for the aims of the order, particularly to reduce car travel by encouraging public transport. However, the order will not achieve the objective of the LTS for promoting sustainable transport and minimising harmful emissions and energy consumption. This is unachievable with current public transport which will not dissuade travelling by car. Much car sharing already takes place and the stadium has excellent links with M8/M77.

Experience at Hampden (with a similar scheme in place) is of increased congestion, queues for trains and overcrowding on trains. Also, there is evidence of pushing cars into residential areas further away from the stadium. There is also a view that these restrictions have resulted in people not going to matches, who otherwise would have done so. Also, there is a view that the restrictions are not the same or are being imposed unfairly.

The order will result in it not being possible to park within walking distance of the stadium. The geographical area of the zone is very large, and will impact almost everyone who travels to the stadium by car or supporters' bus

There are insufficient spaces in the Rangers Albion Car Park. This is stated to be at capacity several hours before the match.

There is insufficient off-street parking available for matches at Ibrox Stadium to cope with the demand. For example, the national stadium has safe parking at Queens Park, which is not available for Ibrox. Park and ride links are totally inadequate. The nearest large park and ride facility is estimated to be over half an hour away. There would be an adverse impact on the city centre – especially at peak times. There is more parking provision at other event venues, eg SECC, Armadillo and Concert Hall.

There is insufficient parking provision for supporters' buses from all over the UK. This is particularly the case if the use of supporters' buses increases with the restrictions. Also, there is a question over the location for disabled supporters.

There is insufficient traffic management, particularly after games. This is exacerbated by the introduction of bus lanes. Police are at the Asda roundabout but nowhere else. Police do not control the junction on PRW just up from the Albion car park. There are long traffic delays after matches. The restrictions would cause

significant adverse impact on other travellers navigating the area on match days. Traffic would flow better with more policing or better traffic light signalling. Police control instead of traffic lights has worked well in the past for the period after the match. Priority given to supporters' buses causes huge tail-backs, as well as U-turns resulting from vehicles coming out of streets because they have been unable to park.

It is also suggested that the traffic around the stadium has become significantly worse in the last couple of years, as a result of how the police and stewards manage the traffic.

There is an acceptance that proposals would make sense if the existing public transport system could cope with the number of people attending matches. But that is not the case at the moment.

Current availability of Public Transport for people attending matches

Public transport services are insufficient to cope with the proposed order.

There is particular concern with respect the capacity of the subway, which has experienced increased usage over recent years, and is now at capacity. This relates to the platforms, the trains themselves and queues outside the station. Long queues exist at Govan, Ibrox and Cessnock stations. Queues to Ibrox Station regularly back up as far as the stadium. Also, addressing public queuing on Copeland Street (possibly over 1000 at times) should be a priority. The subway is unsuitable for wheelchairs. The subway could not cope with additional fans following the introduction of the proposed order. There is a suggestion that the subway is used by only around 20% of supporters and is already beyond capacity.

There are no rail stations close to the stadium. Bus services are irregular (not necessarily meeting schedules), full/overcrowded and slow due to the amount of traffic on match days. Bus services to Ibrox from many areas may require multiple changes. In particular buses have difficulty navigating PRW owing to increased traffic, where the main bus route from Glasgow to Ibrox is often overcrowded. Bus stops may not be convenient for people with physical difficulties.

Parking in the city and the using public transport to stadium (park and ride) is not a viable service, and the park and ride facility at Shields Road is unsuitable because of lack of capacity on the subway.

Additional pressure on public transport would adversely affect the existing users of such transport, and cause missed connections on multiple public transport journeys.

Difficulties Using Public Transport

Public transport generally takes significantly longer and is more expensive. It is difficult for people on low incomes

People working before or after matches take place would have insufficient time to get to the stadium by public transport.

Travelling from long distance is difficult by public transport, particularly for Sunday and midweek games at night. Supporters come from all over Scotland England and Ireland.

There would be a particular problem for supporters travelling to matches from Northern Ireland, as a result of it being more difficult to meet the ferry sailing times.

Some people cannot use public transport owing to medical conditions.

Public transport is not so accessible for families with young children.

Required Improvements

There should be a thorough transport infrastructure review, to encourage sustainable transport which meets the needs of the area. There needs to be a more holistic approach. Public transport requires investment and improvement before parking restrictions are introduced.

Possible improvements include:

- RFC should be looking at multi-storey car parking in vicinity of stadium
- Additional parking could be provided with quick access to the motorway network thus avoiding residential areas
- Opening new railway line/station for Ibrox.
- New park and ride facilities using available land which local businesses may be able to provide on match days (possibly including shopping areas such as Silverburn or Braehead), or at or near stations on the main rail network
- Consider free shuttle buses to matches
- Further spaces for supporters' buses are required
- Information published on alternative parking facilities and other transport links
- Provide a pass for people living more than, say, 50 miles away
- Subsidised public transport for people with match tickets
- Should be a drop-off/pick-up plan in place

Effects of the proposed Exclusion Zone

Supporters should not be forced to park in areas that are unsuitable. Concern is expressed from residents outside zone that the order would simply displace parking by supporters out to a new radius line.

Competition for the nearest parking spaces upon the roads where people are still allowed to park would result in earlier parking, in turn resulting in a longer period during which cars would be parked in residential streets.

Any reduction in traffic congestion in the immediate area would be offset by congestion outside the zone.

Many businesses within the zone are closed on Saturday afternoon, and could provide parking.

The permit distribution model is flawed, and would result in an adverse effect on areas outwith the zone.

No proposals are provided for safe walking routes to the stadium from areas outside the 1 km zone.

There would be an adverse effect on congestion/parking relating to the hospital to west of Ibrox.

Staff working for RFC (stewards etc) would be inconvenienced by proposed zone

There is a general acceptance of the need for clearways on emergency routes, but these proposals go beyond that, and are not proportionate.

Restrictions without improvements would be contrary to EHCR.

Health and Safety

There is concern about the ability of Police Scotland to manage the excessive volume of football fans who would need to travel by public transport, and the ability to manage alcohol consumption and anti-social behaviour.

Celtic and Rangers fans using same public transport could cause public disorder and danger to travellers. Need to consider provision for segregation of home and visiting fans. Need to consider the cost of extra policing/stewards to manage these issues.

Concern is expressed for the safety of people walking some distance from the stadium (particularly women) without stewards, and at night.

There is a risk to health and safety from the increased volume of people using the subway within a short space of time. There are already lengthy queues on Copeland Road from Ibrox Stadium and on Paisley Road West from Cessnock Station.

Any difficulties for emergency services could be resolved by other methods.

Objections from residents to the parking restrictions being insufficient or inappropriate

Dumbreck residents object to the system of permits being introduced, which would result in a limited effect on the number of cars coming into the area, and prejudice the parking restrictions in the zone. Multiple permits could worsen the existing situation. Permits do not identify ownership and are easily acquired. The system is essentially too generous. Permits should be issued for separate zones, not for the whole of the zone. Need to know effect on parking numbers compared to existing. It is suggested that parking controls could be revised more in favour of residents.

It is considered that stewards are required to patrol the zone, and GCC and Police Scotland have withdrawn from this responsibility. RFC have supplied stewards as requested by Dumbreck residents – and have offered to continue in the future. However, inconsiderate or unsafe parking and anti-social behaviour occurs and more could be done to manage this.

However, there is also some comment that no problems have occurred over the last 25 years with the existing arrangements, and that there is no reason to add to the difficulties for those visiting from outside the area on match days. Public transport is recognised as inadequate for the purpose of attending football matches.

There is similar concern expressed by residents of other areas, but also including people parking in private car parks, the management of lanes behind existing housing, and the inclusion of one-way systems in the order

There is concern expressed from residents outside the zone, including Kinning Park and Drumoyne, where there is existing pressure for on-street parking, to the effect that the order would exacerbate on-street parking within these areas on event days. There should be more onus on RFC to incentivise the use of public transport. There are also comments relating the actual boundary of the zone with respect to specific streets, and a comment about the possible inclusion of such areas in the zone.

Objections from businesses (various locations) to the parking restrictions being insufficient or inappropriate

There are two objections to the effect on businesses in the area, which are based upon matters already raised in the objections referred to above.

Another business states that parking and loading restrictions would have an adverse effect on the management of the business. This relates to customers, deliveries and permits. A further business is concerned about the effect of residents' permits.

A business is concerned about existing parking restrictions not being enforced, allowing street traders to park, the effect of the designation of this street as an emergency route, and the effect on deliveries to the premises.

A bus organiser from Northern Ireland is concerned about bus parking in Helen Street, and that there is insufficient provision for this under proposed order.

Objection on behalf of a church, refers to the inclusion of its property within the order, which the council now proposes to exclude, but also expresses concern that the order will encourage non-church users to park within their area. Assistance with the provision of barriers to prevent access to church property, and provision of a quantity of unregistered permits is requested. The council appears to have confirmed that these would be provided.

Note: the detailed matters raised on behalf of Rangers Football Club are set out in its letter of objection, which is referred to in the attached schedule.

Council's responses to objections

The council needs to encourage more sustainable methods of transport by dissuading travel by private car to stadia. The proposals are in accordance with the council's local transport strategy, and are aimed at areas negatively affected by current parking practices.

Meetings have been held with SPT, Scotrail and bus operators to establish current levels of service and possible improvements. Bus operators advise that no real improvement can be made owing to the volume of traffic in area. If traffic levels are reduced this may be reviewed. SPT has noted that Shields Road car park has capacity to be used further on match days. SPT also currently operate 114 park and ride facilities throughout the area. SPT is responsible for the management of the subway, and is aware of the council's intentions.

There is no evidence to suggest that the zone would have a detrimental economic effect on the area – those using public transport may spend more time in the area.

Dropping off and picking up is accommodated within the zone where loading and unloading is permitted. Disabled badge holders are accommodated in the zone.

Any arrangements for free use of public transport would need to be discussed and agreed by RFC and the transport providers. Discussion with respect to the re-opening of Ibrox station is not part of these proposals.

No parking is allowed on emergency routes which designated by Police Scotland.

During extreme weather no form of travel would be recommended, and matches would be likely to be cancelled.

Bus operators consider no improvements can be made without a commensurate reduction in traffic on match days. However, supporters' buses would be accommodated in the area in locations agreed with Police Scotland. Additional locations could be provided in the future if necessary.

Residents and businesses have permits available free of charge (except administration costs). There is a £10.00 administration cost for a 10-year resident's visitor parking permit. Permits are only required within the zone during operational hours.

The parking controls are designed to allow the community to operate as normal. Organisations including churches, local businesses and community clubs will be able to apply for permits free of charge. Applications for permits will be decided and monitored by the council's Customer and Business Services team. Measures are in place to prevent forgery, but any complaints reported would be investigated by enforcement team

Similar proposals have already been Implemented for Hampden Park and Scotstoun, and are being proposed for Celtic Park. Proposals have also recently been published for parking controls around the SECC and Hydro. The control of traffic for events in Bellahouston Park is not managed or enforced by the council. The event organisers pay and arrange for this themselves.

It is hoped that these proposals will encourage the use of sustainable transport, but any effect on other areas outside the zone would be monitored. Any vehicle contravening the parking restrictions would receive a Penalty Charge Notice and may be uplifted. Reviewing parking controls after they are implemented would involve analysing any feedback received.

Anti-social behaviour is a matter for the police.

There are off-street car parks available across Glasgow operated by different companies. An online search could identify their location.

Restricting parking within the whole area of the zone, including industrial areas around Ibrox, will assist traffic flows as it will discourage cars from going into such areas to seek parking places.

With respect to employees, the council would hope that RFC would have a green staff travel plan to encourage employees to use sustainable transport.

The council seeks to be an autism friendly city and is aware of the co-operation needed from transport providers and local businesses to ensure this is possible. SPT and Ibrox are understood to be working with the relevant organisations to help create an accessible environment.

Letters of Support

From residents (or visitors) of Dumbreck (mainly; some unspecified)

Order would improve amenity and safety of area (covering the following matters)

Residential conservation area

Abuse from people driving in and out of the area

Parking in front of driveways and near junctions

Cars parked along whole of one side of street preventing two-way traffic

Difficulty for emergency vehicles, particularly fire engines

Parking from up to 2 hours before match

Safety is compromised through speeding vehicles

Safety for children to play

Damage to property

Traffic congestion in area

Litter dumped on to streets (eg from people eating within cars before they leave)

Food dumped attracts vermin

Pollution from vehicle emissions

Anti-social behaviour, including urinating and sectarian slogans

Less maintenance required

Significant effect on parking for residents and family visitors

Police would have more time for other duties

Breach of ECHR

Proposals should take hundreds of cars off the road providing "green" effect

Letters of support with reservations about permit system

Note: the reporters consider that these letters of support also raise matters which should be considered as objections to the order, along similar lines to the objections from residents of Dumbreck and other areas referred to above.

These residents have concerns about unlimited visitor permits with lack of evidence of need from residents and businesses, and insufficient charge (eg could be £5.00 each year for new application). Should tie to car registration number and postcode and have serial number. Need to make it difficult to pass on permits for example to people attending matches. Careful vetting is required, and there are concerns about how the scheme would be monitored and enforced.

Other matters raised in letters of support

Whilst supporting the restrictions some letters also raise the need to improve public transport and more park and ride facilities. It is considered that the RFC and supporters should work together to move towards more sustainable transport. The current coning system is considered ineffective

There is also a request that the zone should be extended to cover Craigton, and a representation to the effect that the existing situation is preferred to the proposals in the order, because most drivers do nothing wrong. A resident outside the zone support the order

“Gobike” supports the control of parking around the stadium, which will encourage people to use more sustainable transport. Streets are thoroughfares and should not be used to store vehicles. Paisley Road West is one of the most heavily cycled routes in the city, and whilst parking restrictions here (and on adjacent streets) will improve conditions for walking and cycling, Gobike looks forward to the provision of good quality cycle infrastructure in the area.

Additional Council Responses

Residents and businesses will be required to show proof, but placing additional restrictions cannot be considered at this stage in the statutory process. Restricting permits to a specific area cannot be considered. Permits have a unique ref number and can be revoked if misused.

Enforcement teams carry out patrols around Ibrox during major events, and parking contravention notices are issued where appropriate. Enforcement is carried out jointly with Police Scotland. Vehicles on emergency routes will be removed, but in residential areas will receive a parking contravention notice.

Sinéad Lynch
Lance R Guilford

Reporters

25 February 2020